What Can We Know About Our Graduates as They Enter the Workforce

January 19, 2017
Webinar will begin at 3pm ET

Click here to watch the webinar recording
Webinar Details

• For this webinar you will be in listen only mode using your computer or phone
• Please ask questions via the question window
• This webinar is being recorded – you will be sent a recording link

Brought To You By:

CCTA | CENTERS COLLABORATIVE FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE
With Additional Support by the ATE Collaborative Impact Project

ATECENTERS

Disclaimer: This material is based upon work supported by the National Science Foundation under Grants # 1205077 and # 1261893. Any opinions, findings and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Science Foundation.
The CCTA is led by

- **National Center for Convergence Technology (CTC) at Collin College in Frisco, TX (lead)**
- **South Carolina ATE National Resource Center (SCATE) at Florence Darlington Technical College in Florence, SC**
- **Florida ATE Center (FLATE) at Hillsborough Community College in Tampa, FL**
- **Bio-Link Next Generation National ATE Center for Biotechnology and Life Sciences (Bio-Link) at City College of San Francisco in San Francisco, CA**
- **Networks Resource Center at the Maricopa Community College District in Phoenix, AZ**
CCTA Purpose

• Respond to a request from the Department of Labor (DOL) to the NSF to have ATE Centers provide technical assistance services to DOL TAACCCT grantees

• Activities relevant for DOL grants, NSF grants and workforce-oriented programs of all kinds

• Deliverables
  – Topical webinars on existing and new solutions
    • Live/recorded with attendee Q&A
  – Identify and document best practices
  – Host convenings
Poll #1: Your Affiliation

A. I am involved with an NSF grant
B. I am involved with a TAACCCT grant
C. Both
D. Neither
Poll: How many people are listening with you?

A. None
B. 1
C. 2
D. 3 or more
TODAY’S PRESENTERS

Michael Lesiecki
Director
MATEC
Maricopa Community College District

John Carrese
Director
San Francisco Bay Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research
Agenda

• Why do we want to know?
• What can we know?
• How can we know it?
• Dive in and look in depth at
  – Pilot attempts at the Maricopa Community Colleges
  – The CTE Employment Outcomes Survey at the California Community Colleges
Why?

• Are our CTE students employable?
• Do they find jobs in the field in which we trained them?
• Do they see an increase in income?
What?

Do We Want To Know?
What is it about the program that students value and why?
What is our market for this program?

i.e. what students are we trying to recruit into the program, and why?
How much do students earn after graduation and what factors can this be attributed to?
How does our program compare, to similar programs in other colleges, in terms of employment and earnings results?
What Can We Know?

• What the graduates tell us
• What the government will tell us about them
• What social media or other tools might say about graduates
How Can We Know It?

• Send out a survey by email to graduates
• Do a phone survey
• Use Department of Economic Security Data
  – UI Wage Data
• Mine Social Media
  – Service provider like EMSI aggregates from the web SM
Examples from the Maricopa Community Colleges

Project: Moving low income adults into middle skill jobs

• A key performance indicator was “after program” employment
Create Your Own Call Center Approach

1. Create database and call lists
2. Script call: five questions
3. On the phone: engaging the student and careful note taking yield rich information
Measures

57%

- $137/378 = 36\%$ reporting employment
- $81/378 = 21\%$ no employment
- $160/378 = 42\%$ no contact

$7000/218 = $32 per contact
Time and Money

• Successful calls (average 8 minutes)
• Unsuccessful (average 1.5 minutes)
• In one hour: 4 successful calls, 20 unsuccessful
• 250 successful calls in 67 hours
Engage A Call Center
Observations

- 91% of graduates invited to participate in the survey
- 19% of those dialed resulted in a completed survey
- 7% of numbers provided unreachable (i.e. wrong number, disconnected, etc.)

9,500 Calls Placed
3.3 Avg. Attempts

2844 Graduates
2589 Messaged
1559 Graduates Reached
550 Survey Participants
Contracting With A Call Center: Time and Money

• Five weeks
• 550 reached, 19%
• Cost $25,000/550 = $45/contact plus internal time
Send Them a Email Survey

• 1832 graduates from 2012-14
• 9% response
Ask the Government
Using Unemployment Insurance Wage Data to Improve Program Employment Outcomes:
A Technical Assistance Guide for Community and Technical Colleges
For Reference

• CA's experience with UI wage data

• Salary data on general areas of study is displayed for a) 2 years before training, b) 2 years after and c) 5 years after.

• That tool is called, "Salary Surfer" and it can be found at this website:

http://salarysurfer.cccco.edu/SalarySurfer.aspx
Question Break
Audience Poll

We have tried:
A. Email Surveys
B. Phone Surveys
C. Alumni social media-based, data-mining
D. UI wage data
E. None of the above (yet)
The California Community College CTE Employment Outcomes Survey: Overview
CTE Outcomes Survey: Background

- Piloted with fifteen California Community Colleges in 2012

- Collaborative effort among community college consortia, the Chancellor’s Office, the RP Group, and Santa Rosa Junior College
  - It all started at a CCCAOE conference
  - Modeled primarily after Cabrillo College’s Completer/Leaver Surveys

- Dual purposes:
  - Provide insightful information for local program improvement
  - Collect statewide data for documentation of CTE outcomes

- Practitioner-Driven Effort
  - Statewide meetings, conference calls, collaboration
  - All methodology, implementation and survey questions vetted
  - Use survey to collect data and information not available elsewhere
  - Report format developed in response to practitioner needs
CTE Outcomes Survey: Methodology

Survey Distribution
• 3 Modalities: e-mail, then US mail, then phone calls
• Survey conducted approximately 1.5 years after completing/leaving

Sample (2016)
• All students included who met the criteria
  o By 13/14, had either earned a vocational award of 6+ units OR earned 9+ CTE units AND did not enroll in more than 5 units in 14/15
  o Skill Builders

Data
• Chancellor’s Office MIS data wherever possible
• Local data supplement (student contact information)
• Survey response data
CTE Outcomes Survey: Primary Purpose

The big questions...

• Are our CTE students employable?
• Do they find jobs in the field in which we trained them?
• Do they see an increase in income?

...in other words, was the program worth it? Are we justified in offering it?
CTE Outcomes Survey: Overall Statewide Results 2016
Statewide Findings

- 28% Response Rate
- 91% Satisfaction Rate with education and training
- 38% transferred
Findings: Employment Status

77% of respondents are employed for pay

- Employed at one job, 57%
- Employed at more than one job, 11%
- Unemployed, NOT seeking, 9%
- Unemployed, AND seeking, 9%
- Working, not for pay, AND seeking, 1%
- Working, not for pay, NOT seeking, 1%
- Self-employed, 9%
Findings: Work Status

More students worked full time after completing studies and training.
Findings: Working in the Field of Training

The majority of students (69%) indicated their current job is in their field of study, or in a field that is “close.”

How Closely Related to Your Job is Your Field of Study?

- In the same field
- Close
- Not Related
Findings: Wage Increase

The hourly wage of respondents increased 41% from their hourly wage before their studies/training ($17.62) to their hourly wage after completing their studies/training ($24.87).
CTE Outcomes Survey: Statewide Results for the Past 5 Years
Participation and Response Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th># of Colleges</th>
<th>Overall Response Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Response Rate:
- 2012: 30%
- 2013: 24%
- 2014: 20%
- 2015: 25%
- 2016: 28%
- 2017: 30%

# of Colleges Participating:
- 2012: 15
- 2013: 35
- 2014: 37
- 2015: 40
- 2016: 70
- 2017: 113
Employment Status

- Unemployed and Seeking
- Unemployed and Not Seeking
- Employed at One Job
- Employed at More Than One Job
- Self Employed
- Transferred
Employed in Field (or “close”)
Change in Wages Over Time

- CTEOS 2012*
- CTEOS 2013
- CTEOS 2014
- CTEOS 2015
- CTEOS 2016

Wages Before
Wages After
% Change
CTE Outcomes Survey: Use of Findings
Use of Findings

Accountability evidence supporting the efficacy of CTE
  o CTE Data Unlocked Launchboard
  o ACCJC Reporting
  o Gainful Employment Reporting
  o Possible CalVet Reporting

Promotional information underscoring the value of CTE
  o Annual college level report

Program review and improvement data
  o Full data sets are provided to each college
  o Program renewal/discontinuance
  o Advisory boards
  o Local Institutional Effectiveness metrics
For More Detailed Findings:

- CTEOS Project website:
  
  https://cteos.santarosa.edu/
Contact Information

Through Project website:
https://cteos.santarosa.edu

John Carrese:
jcarrese@ccsf.edu
(415)452-5529
Join Us – All Webinars 3 pm Eastern

Coming up: a four part series to support creating proposals for NSF ATE programs that are due in early October 2017.

February 16th – The Starting Point: Innovation, Planning and Grant Goals
March 9th – Grant Proposal Resources, Roadmaps and Timelines
March 23rd – Developing Stakeholder Partnerships Internally and Externally for Successful Grants
April 20th – Final Tips for a Competitive Proposal

This series also offers a follow-up call one week after each webinar. This gives attendees the opportunity to ask further questions.

February 23rd – Follow-up Q&A Call for Feb 16th Webinar
March 16th – Follow-up Q&A Call for Mar 9th Webinar
March 30th – Follow-up Q&A Call for Mar 23rd Webinar
April 27th – Follow-up Q&A Call for Apr 20th Webinar

For Other Upcoming Webinars See: http://www.atecenters.org/ccta
Join us in Salt Lake City, UT!

July 17-20, 2017

www.highimpact-tec.org
DOL and NSF Workforce Convening

- Free follow-up DOL and NSF Workforce convening for all TAACCCT grantees and others who can benefit on Friday, July 21.
WEBINAR SURVEY

Please take a moment to help us become better...