

# Planning for Sustainability

## May 12, 2015

Ann Beheler - Good afternoon, welcome to our webinar. Our webinar today is on *Planning for Sustainability*.

### **Webinar Details**

Ann Beheler - For this webinar you will be in listen-only mode using either your computer or your phone please do ask your questions using the chat window over to the side and the webinar is being recorded you will be able to have the recording link it will be sent to you afterwards along with copies of the slides.

### **Brought To You By**

Ann Beheler - This webinar is actually brought to you by the Centers Collaborative for Technical Assistance which is a National Science Foundation grant and it is supported by the ATE Collaborative Impact Project the ATECenters project.

### **The CCTA Is Led By**

Ann Beheler - It is led by a group of five National Science Foundation Centers you can read the names of the centers on the list.

### **CCTA Purpose**

Ann Beheler - Our purpose is to respond to a request from the Department of Labor to provide technical assistance from the Advanced Technological Education Center to provide technical assistance to the Department of Labor TAACCCT grantees regarding success coaching, convenings, knowledge management and peer-to-peer learning.

### **CCTA Activities are Relevant for**

Ann Beheler – As well as the information we do provide its relevant for Department of Labor grants, National Science Foundation projects and centers and workforce oriented programs of all kinds.

### **Deliverables**

Ann Beheler - Our deliverables include webinars such as what we are doing today on existing and new solutions, they're live and recorded with Q&A and they will be archived on ATECentral.net and we will also include other online media including videos and transcripts.

### **Deliverables Continued**

Ann Beheler - We will also be inviting folks to regional discipline specific conferences and we will be giving you best practices and hosting convenings and we'll talk about one of those that's upcoming in July as we get to the end of this presentation.

### **Presenters**

Ann Beheler - We have several presenters today, my name is Ann Beheler, I'm the Principal Investigator and Executive Director for the National Convergence Technologies Center, I'm in the lower left hand corner. We also have Rachel Bower who is the Director of the Internet Scout Group and ATECentral; she is the Principal Investigator for that group. In the middle we have Elaine Craft who is Principal Investigator and Director for the South Carolina ATE Center of Excellence. And we also have Elaine

Johnson who is the Executive Director and Principal Investigator for the Bio-Link Center. And we have Anna Kolliopoulos who is the Assistant Director and Co-PI for the South Carolina Advanced Technological Education Center of Excellence also.

### **Poll#1: Your Affiliation**

Ann Beheler - We are ready for our first poll and for this Mike Lesiecki is going to help us would you please select whether you are involved with a National Science Foundation grant, with a TAACCCT grant, both or neither so that we will know what our audience is working with. We'll give you a few minutes, well not minutes a few seconds to answer. My screen is actually not showing the result so would one of my co-presenters let me know when that is showing.

Michael Lesiecki – Ann, its Mike we're looking at the results of the poll that shows 12 percent are involved with an NSF grant, 58 with a TAACCCT grant, so that's the majority, 24 with both which is pretty interesting and six neither.

Ann Beheler - Ok and this is Mike Lesiecki he is actually the Principal Investigator with the MATEC Center based at Phoenix they are in Phoenix and they are responsible for the recording today.

Michael Lesiecki - Thank you Ann.

### **Elaine Craft**

Ann Beheler – Thank you very much I appreciate that thank you Mike. Alright we're going to start off with first with Elaine Craft. And Elaine I'll let you introduce yourself here.

Elaine Craft – Thanks Ann, I am as Ann said earlier Elaine Craft and I'm with the National Resource Center for Expanding Excellence in Technician Education in South Carolina. I'd like to start today by addressing the webinar topic itself sustainability.

### **Why Focus on Sustainability**

Elaine Craft - Why should we be concerned with this? If you think about what grants are designed to do planning for sustainability makes sense. Grants are designed to either jump start programs or provide specific support to accomplish specific relatively short-term objectives. What grants aren't designed to do is to provide operational support on an ongoing basis no matter how good your work is or how much you accomplish, you can't depend on grant funding to keep it going. Those who make grant awards have high expectations not just for a spike in activity but for longer-term impacts. Those making grant awards expect the grantee.

### **Why Focus on Sustainability**

Elaine Craft – The National Science Foundation has this requirement as stated in their publication 14-577 expects both centers and projects will be sustained or institutionalized past the period of award funding. A sustainability plan is an essential component of the project description in every competitive proposal, next slide please.

### **Why Focus on Sustainability**

Elaine Craft - Likewise the Department of Labor is also has expectations for sustainability. In the TAACCCT round four RFP last year there was a clear assignment of points to be awarded based on the strength of the sustainability plan within a proposal. The RFP specified that DOL expectation that grantees will integrate strategies and activities included in their proposal into their non-grant-funded

programs for continued success. In addition DOL expects the third party evaluation of a TAACCCT project to investigate the contributions and commitment of partners and key stakeholders toward programs sustainability, next slide please.

### **What is Sustainability?**

Elaine Craft - Now that we know what is expected it is clear that this is a topic that we need to fully understand and address. So the first question maybe, what its sustainability? What does this mean in the context of a grant-funded initiative? To answer this question let's look again at what those who are funding us have to say both NSF and DOL defined sustainability, interestingly NSF puts the definition in the context of value to the host institution, partners and target audience. If something is really a value to those who derive benefit from the grant funded effort then they will want to sustain. This leaves the door open to the possibility that additional funds may be necessary and possible to sustain the effort. DOL on the other hand look for evidence of integration into non funded programs for continued success.

### **Rachel Bower**

Elaine Craft - We will now turn our attention to additional ways to understand and plan for sustainability of grant-funded projects, it is always a good idea to see what can be learned from research on a topic you're trying to understand for this perspective I'm turning you over to my ATE colleague Rachel Bower. Rachel?

Rachel Bower – Thanks so much Elaine, it's great to be here today and to be sharing a little bit of information that we've gleaned from our work at ATECentral, next slide please.

### **Primary Purpose: Amplify the Impact of ATE**

Rachel Bower - ATECentral acts as an information hub for the ATE community and our goal is really to amplify the impact of the ATE program in support the wonderful work ATE grantees are doing across the country. We do that through our online portal which you can find it ATECentral.net our resource collection we've pulled together information about all the wonderful curriculum and professional development materials that are created by ATE as well as the suite of services and tools. And what I'm really gonna talk to you most about today is the sustainability support that we've been offering to the community, next slide please. So this sustainability support was done in, can I have the next slide Ann?

### **ATE Central's Sustainability Support**

Rachel Bower - In reaction to and in response to an articulated community need and with ongoing community input. So we really wanted to make sure that we were creating a service that was of use to the community, we did a survey related to community needs and sustainability support really rose to the top of the list for a lot of ATE PIs and what we came up with in conjunction with our colleagues at Ithaca S&R was based on research from within and beyond the ATE community and it we offer workshops, webinars and a host of online resources as well, next slide please.

### **General Sustainability Examples**

Rachel Bower - So we're gonna be looking at five different research reports in just a moment, but I thought it might be hopeful before we looked at the those after Elaine's very helpful discussion of what constitutes sustainability and talking a little bit about what our funders expect to remind ourselves of what we mean by sustainability sort of the nuts and bolts of it. Here are a few examples, one would be the host institution commits to maintaining some of the faculty or staff positions that were hired under your grant funding; another might be that some of your project partners agree to supply external resources to fund some of the components after that Department of Labor or NSF funding sunsets or

maybe some other organization or another college or university commits to continuing to use, improve and disseminate some of the materials that you've developed during your project. So those are three good basic examples of sustainability, and I thought it would be helpful to have this as we start to talk about the research and the key findings, next slide Ann.

### **Sustainability Research: Reports**

Rachel Bower - So we looked at an awful lot of research when we were starting to create our sustainability training opportunities in our sustainability support service and I'm just gonna talk briefly about this set of 5 reports, you'll be able to get to these when you are looking at the web these are all links (lost audio) a really wonderful way to be able to sort of create a system of checks and balances to make sure that your honing in on the right thing. So the first two are fairly conventional types of research from within ATE they're observational research where people went and actually talked to folks in the ATE community about how they were sustaining what they were doing. The second two or more sort of self-reported, so the third one on here "The Conference" is actually one that Michael Lesiecki who came on momentarily there you heard his voice many of us in the ATE community know Mike really well and he convened a meeting where he brought together a group of centers and they got into the really sort of discussions around challenges and success stories for themselves within ATE around sustainability. So what they were having luck with, what they were struggling with. The fourth study on the slide is also self-reporting it was a survey that was done but people were self-reporting system (audio issue) sustainability here in the USA and overseas around sustainability particularly as digital resources so we have a nice suite of reports here that you can take a look at if you're interested, next slide please.

### **Sustainability Research: Key Findings**

Rachel Bower - The thing that's really interesting as I mentioned is that these key findings show up over and over and over again, which is how you kind of know that you got key findings right they're the ones that consistently rise to the top, and I'm gonna go through these a bit the wonderful thing about the rest of the presentation after this section is that the folks who are also presenting will be kind of drilling down a little bit into some of these various areas and talking to you about examples and providing more information about how these have been implemented. So this first one is really important it's really one of the big takeaways its institutionalization or embedding so research has shown that the more deeply cut you are to your own institution the more you're able to help folks see that what you're doing speaks to the mission of the institution the better chance you have of sustaining either all of your work or at least the most valuable parts the parts that are most used to the end users the folks you're creating material or the activities for. The second takeaway has to do with defining your audience and stakeholders, knowing who those folks are, knowing who you're creating this for, knowing their needs, understanding them, really really important. If you're not creating materials that are of value to your audience and stakeholders you're probably going to have a tougher time sustaining what you're doing. Evaluation and understanding your value proposition this gets into data we're gonna get into that next Elaine is going to talk about that, understanding how to collect data that helps you recognize which things are value is really really important. Thinking creatively, thinking like an entrepreneur this is something that came out of Mike Lesiecki's report, where folks really saw the value in thinking out of outside the box and thinking like an entrepreneur in terms of the ways that they might sustain what they were doing. And then while it seems like it should be obvious the earlier you start the better so thinking early and often about sustainability and integrating that into your planning, next slide please.

### **Questions?**

Rachel Bower - So I'm kind of done with my portion of the webinar today but I wondered if there were any questions and I don't know if any have come up yet Ann for me or anyone else from the panel.

Ann Beheler - We have one question, when they start talking about starting to plan early, how early? We're just in our first year should we be thinking about sustainability this early? Would you like to answer that Rachel?

Rachel Bower - I'd be happy to and of course anyone else who'd like to chime in of the presenters cause you all have so much experience to with this. But I think that you know the earlier you start the better for most of us who have NSF grants we are asked to talk about sustainability right in that proposal and I would think that many of you who have TAACCCT grants are also asked to do that, so you even in year one and you can begin to start to think about how to put in place the ways to gather data that may help you as you think about sustainability and the ways to gather data that are going to help you evaluate what you're doing and what constitutes valuable work to your audiences. If you have an external evaluator that may be something that you want at least chat with them about too. So from my perspective the people that I've seen who have sustained things long-term they are in part successful because they start to think about it as early as that first year.

Elaine Johnson – This is Elaine Johnson; I would like to add to that and support exactly what you have been saying Rachel. I think that even within the proposal time itself it's important to be aware that there are processes to go through to get information that can be of great value for sustainability over the long haul and the inclusion of the evaluator is a very important part of that.

Rachel Bower – Thanks so much Elaine, I know you guys are going to get into to some of the more practical and some nuts and bolts elements of this in and I'm gonna turn it over to Elaine Craft who's gonna talk about sustainability and implementation.

### **How to Implement?**

Elaine Craft - Thank you Rachel. With the research perspective in mind and understanding the role of data we can now ask the question, how do we want to approach sustainability planning in our project? The first step is to consider what are evaluators and data tell us is working; this is information that will help us determine what's worth sustaining, what works and what doesn't. If something did not work and thus is not worth sustaining it is important to keep in mind that the less successful components of your work are still of value as lessons learned. It's very important to not only know what doesn't work but to also examine the reasons why. Perhaps some of your assumptions were incorrect or the economy took an unexpected turn, perhaps partners didn't do their part or there was some unanticipated delay in implementation, there any number of reasons things don't turn out the way we expect that they will. If there are things that turned out well and data show that the intervention or innovation was successful then how can you keep it going, some things will take money actually many things will take money but there are some other things that can be integrated to create a new way of operating with our institutions. Teaching, serving students or working with partners that can be continued with no money but a lot of determination and planning, next slide please.

### **Funding**

Elaine Craft - Like my colleagues working with the Centers Collaborative for Technical Assistance we've all been at this for a long time, I personally have been directing NSF ATE grants for 21 years and I've been working with TAACCCT grants since round 1. I'm sharing the following thoughts with you from that experience and certainly from making my share of wrong turns along the way. Many grantees make the mistake of thinking the college will be so impressed with the work of a project that project personnel

will be permanently added to the payroll when the grantee ends and/or activities that the grant paid for will now be financed by the college however request of this type may well result in a response similar to the picture on this slide. It isn't that the institution doesn't love you and all that you've done it's just that their pockets are empty that's what they'll tell you, all funds are committed otherwise, state-support is dwindling, the college needs to be reducing expenses not adding personnel and funding activities that were not already in the budget prior to receiving the grant. In some cases college funding actually will be available to continue some aspects of a grants but just don't count on it. Also when the college comes up with financial support it will be in response to a very impressive set of project outcomes that includes return on investment data that shows that the continuation will increase revenues in excess of the cost. Looking for external funding is also a possibility but keep in mind that seeking external funding is a strategy that involves lag time and thus is hard to align with the end of the project. Back to Rachel comment about starting early that's one reason why you really want think about this from the beginning this is particularly true of grants, you will need to be preparing and submitting proposals long before your grant ends and grant proposals must be endorsed by the college and be aligned with the institutional strategic priorities, not just something that can meet your project or personal needs. The NSF program is an excellent place to consider working with your college to apply for funds to take your TAACCCT grant to another level. NSF ATE funds can address faculty development needs, help you strengthen your industry partnerships and stimulate program improvement in ways that are not possible with TAACCCT grants. If you are new to the ATE program there is a Mentor-Connect service funded by NSF ATE that can help you prepare and submit a competitive grant proposal that targets technician education. The ATE program does not fund projects in healthcare such as nursing programs but it does cover all other advanced technologies that drive our nation's economy. For future financial support donations may also be an option but you need to be very careful with this strategy and work in concert with your college Development Office most colleges are very strategic about that how they approach business and industry for donations and trust me they won't take kindly to unauthorized efforts to raise money. Generating money however is just one approach to sustainability let's look at the other institutionalization, next slide please.

### **Institutionalization**

Elaine Craft - I appreciate the DOL emphasis on institutionalization weaving improved services and innovation into existing infrastructure; adding or modifying programs and curriculum and upgrading technology can offer sustained improvements in workforce development this is one strategy that you can implement when you have determination but perhaps a little or no money the important thing to understand however is that institutionalization does not happen automatically it takes a plan, determination and ongoing effort. It requires deliberate integration of new ideas, curriculum, resources and equipment into the fabric of the institution. It requires a plan for adoption of equipment, curriculum and resources for those who would use and take care of them. It also requires in many cases behavior modification by those who teach new content or develop and implement courses in new way and ongoing work and communication are required to nurture and sustain partnerships. Basic human resistance to change is well documented so how do you foster teamwork to pull all of the puzzle pieces together? One thing that is central for TAACCCT grantees particularly those who have been hired for a project and thus are new to the college is getting to really know the college and how the current systems work within the college. From the beginning you should be looking for permanent homes and internal champions for various components of your project within the existing structure and personnel of the college this is critical to long-term success. My advice is not to treat your grant as a standalone endeavor but rather as a catalyst to move the existing institutional enterprise forward. From the beginning start seeking out those departments and programs within the college that can benefit from what you're doing, those individuals who will be interested in adopting earning and maintaining the

equipment that you are able to purchase and faculty whose interest is aligned with curriculum additions or improvements being developed. If your work increases resources, enrollment and student success and existing college programs you'll find it easy to make friends. Give some thought to who can benefit from the resources you have. As you work on industry partnerships make sure you know which industries are already working with the college and in what ways, it is very important collaborate with the right people within the College in reaching out to industry it is important that the college speak with one voice to industry and that you don't appear to be making unrelated contacts that will be confusing and could even work at cross purposes with existing college initiative. At the college and with your academic partners work to earn the trust and buy in of those who can become champions for the outcomes of your grant. Work on your internal communications, tell people what you are working down and brainstorm with them ways your project can help them with their students, with other work they're doing. Keep an eye out for existing resources you can leverage through this process of discovery for example to help a TAACCCT round one grant at my college our NSF ATE Center was able to share recruitment resources for advanced manufacturing programs including posters, brochures and access to high-end career awareness videos from ATE TV, all that could be used to attract students these resources made it possible for the project team to begin recruiting immediately it was months before they were in a position to develop their own recruitment materials and even then their budget for doing so with limited. Conversely the TAACCCT grant acquired some resume writing software that our ATE students were able to use to better equip themselves to enter the job market. Throughout the project we collaborated in a number of activities that benefit both initiatives. I hope that you can see that it is important that you be as purposeful in partnering internally with your organization as you are a partnering with business and industry or other organizations outside of the organization that is the key to institutionalization. Personnel turnover for your project is practically a given particularly near the end of the grant the permanent college personnel however will still be there you will need to depend on these individuals in the final months of your project and having strong relationships in place at that point in time will serve you well and will increase the probability that elements of your good work will be successfully integrated and sustained.

### **Journey to Sustainability**

Now I'm gonna ask my colleague, Anna Kolliopoulos to share a real-world example of how grant funded initiative has been sustained, Anna.

Anna Kolliopoulos - Thank you Elaine. Now I will talk about a specific example of a grant activity in its journey to sustainability the South Carolina ATE Internship Program at Florence Darlington Technical College was funded by an NSF grant after the funding ran out this work was maintained through other grant funds. Today South Carolina Internship Program has been institutionalized and is supported by a full-time position at Florence Darlington Technical College, next slide please.

### **SC ATE Internship Program**

Anna Kolliopoulos - The South Carolina ATE Internship Program started out as a grant-funded activity in 2000, provide a full time position to develop and implement the South Carolina ATE Internship Program as well as develop the industry consortium. The products of this work were the creation of the consortium by-laws and placement of Engineering Technology student in internships. The creation of the consortium with timely as there was a high demand for engineering technician and local companies are stealing technicians from each other. So through the consortium a base internship pay rate was established and a mechanism for industries to grow their own technician work force was created. The benefits of the students were immediate as they were able to connect what they were learning in the classroom to real-world application, next slide please.

### **SC ATE Internship Program**

Anna Kolliopoulos - When the initial funding ended the South Carolina ATE Internship Program was maintained in the South Carolina ATE Center through other grant funds. I think it is important to note that the function was maintained and not the position, one lesson learned was that this work was incorporated within another position at a reduced time commitment even though the time spent on the internship program and industry consortium was reduced the impact was enhanced as it was now incorporated into project managers position who also managed the NSF S-STEM scholarship. This provided students with one point of contact and many of the candidates for internship were also candidates for scholarship. A combination of internship and scholarships have provided the South Carolina ATE Center and Florence Darlington Technical College with multiple tools to aide in student success. Another lesson learned was that faculty were not good candidates for maintaining the internship program they were not available throughout the day to respond to industry need nor do they have the network or relationship outside their academic discipline to meet the industry's varied request to be effective an internship program must be multi-disciplinary with the ability to respond to industry need regardless of the technology program. Today the South Carolina ATE Internship Program has been institutionalized as part of a full time permanent college position, over its journey it has undergone changes to meet industry needs and the economic climate and been expanded to include multiple technology programs from welding to machine tool to engineering. Through the South Carolina Internship experiences students have received a well-rounded experience to ensure success in their permit employment. Over the past 14 years a hundred and ninety students have worked over 428 semesters, the value that the ATE Internship Program and industry consortium has brought Florence Darlington Technical Colleges ability to meet industry needs have resulted in the institutionalization of this work.

### **Elaine Johnson**

Anna Kolliopoulos - Now Elaine Johnson of Bio-Link will share another example of sustainability.

Elaine Johnson – Thanks Anna. For the next example of sustainability we're going to look at a Bio-Link example.

### **Bio-Link Sustainability Planning**

Elaine Johnson – Bio-Link is an ATE National Center based at City College of San Francisco and its focus is on biotechnology and life sciences. The Bio-Link has also been involved in a round 2 TAACCCT grant the consortium for Bio-technology credentials so we have a long history of being an ATE Center and a shorter history of working with Department of Labor funds. The Department of Labor portion of what we're doing is to be the hub for a laboratory skills and also to provide development of a stackable credential for environmental monitoring. The thing that I'm going to talk about first is how we began our sustainability planning early and to utilize data resources. The first one was professional development feedback; in conjunction with our evaluator we have gathered data about the effectiveness of our professional development activities. Professional development has been a major focus of the Bio-Link center since its beginning in 1998, we gather information from the participants at the workshop but clearly it's better to gather information on the usefulness and implementation of the workshop in teaching and learning and we work together very closely with our evaluator to get that kind of information. We also are interested in how well our industry is engage with gather information from our national survey about how industry as each of the programs that we serve across the nation and we make them on our website and discuss this kind of industry involvement and how to how to grow that



and many of our meetings during the year. We've also been very active in labor market studies at first using labor market studies that were available through the industry but more recently being much more actively engaged with a new organization The Coalition of State Bioscience Institutes that has published "Life Science Workforce Trends in 2014" and we've seen a 15% increase in the job market since 2010. We've also been a partner in creating a statewide overview of life science and middle skill jobs in California comparing the supply and demand and this was published in October of 2014. The learnings from that study showed a gap in the number of jobs that were being posted with the community college preparation of technicians so it gives us some kind of information to be confident that our programs are really needed in the different regions of the country. We also have been looking and developing resources around the economic importance of the programs and preparing reports to provide information back to administrators of the college's how important some of our different types of new programs are particularly contract services. We're of course using our web analytics to identify who are users are and what that usage is and there has been a striking spike in the use of LinkedIn for the Biotech community. From the beginning we have recognized some of the importance of archiving some of our materials especially the curriculum and instructional materials clearinghouse that those materials were meta-tagged and housed at a internet scout with the realization that we wanted to keep these materials after Bio-Link funding stopped. We also planned ahead for equipment maintenance because we were we have very high end equipment that requires a lot of maintenance, maintenance contracts are not generally part of the grants and so we wanted to make sure that we had a way that the college would absorb the maintenance of the equipment and we made agreements with different departments to do that. We're currently responding to some additional needs, one of them is the need for career information that is specific for the technician level positions also communicating this using both our websites and our on-site workshops to clearly communicate with our colleagues about what we have at their logo and what they have available to share with us we have. So at the request of industry developed an equipment distribution center of donated equipment very much needed by the teachers in the regions and finally we have clearly recognized the need for serving underprepared students and have created a bridge that is a model for preparing entry level students who have in the past been screened out by gatekeeper courses, next slide please.

### **Strategies for Sustainability**

Elaine Johnson - So as we look at one example from Bio-Link, one of the things that we're really proud of is the development of a community of practice that has grown from a handful of programs in the country to now over a hundred and eight programs that are actively engaging with each other and sharing what's working locally within their own communities at their own community colleges. A key component of this learning community is the Bio-Link annual Summer Fellows Forum, the Fellows Forum is designed to be a working retreat where the fellows have an active role in addressing the pressing needs of programs at community and technical colleges, we share successes and learn from each other over the years participants have identified resources to pay for their attendance at this meeting. NSF has also emphasized the continuation of the Summer Fellows Forum and has included some funding for Fellows each year. This face-to-face gathering permits us to dig deep into strategies for sustainability and leadership development, procession of key personnel, our evaluator plays a strong role in assisting with gathering data and providing analysis. Our national business community provides suggestions for sustainability that are then discussed and acted upon at the Summer Fellows Forum. We are now preparing for our 17th annual forum where we will be actively planning based on input from multiple sources including partnerships with other like-minded groups and now I'll turn it over to Ann Beheler.

### **NISGTC Sustainability**

Ann Beheler – Thanks Elaine. One thing I did not need to know earlier in addition to being the PI for a National Center for Convergence Technology which is IT plus communication I'm also the Executive Director for a round 1 20 million dollar TAACCCT consortium that is in six states with seven partner and as part of that grant we did specify some sustainability originally most of it was institutionalized of curriculum and so forth, some of it had to do with the equipment that was being purchased but one of the things that we found was that after we got to working with our career coaches and our tutors, it was our general sense that our students that utilized our grant services such as the tutor and our test prep software and the career coaches we felt like they were doing better than those students that did not use those services and as you're well aware if you're a TAACCCT grantee you cannot restrict the services to just your participants you do have to provide those services to others as well. But we thought that the ones that we're using our services were actually doing better and what we finally did we got the instructional design folks to cross reference our actual grant data of who had actually used our services to the retention data from fall to spring and what we realized was actually better than what we expected. We found that the data indicated that fall to spring retention for those people that used our service was almost double that of those who didn't. Those who didn't use our services retention was in the 30% and those who did it was in the 60 percent and that actually spoke to our administrator we were planning on retaining or trying to go for hard money to retain two career coaches and we actually happened to have this data come in at a time when we had a business group on campus and we presented this data to them and they actually suggested we try to retain more career coaches and they actually also said that they would sign their names to a request letter to the budget committee suggesting that the career coaches had been most effective and that they thought it was a good idea for the colleges to go ahead and retain more career coaches. Turns out that the administration is going to the budget committee to try to retain a total of three coaches and its all based data. I think it's very important you know initially we said hey we felt like that the people that were using our services were doing better that was primarily on self-reporting from the student that were using the services but once we got the data we have hard data to present to the administration and based on that data we're actually getting some results. Now we actually also have some focus groups so that we have qualitative data as well, the students who did not use our services or sign our participants form we found out that they were not using services mostly because they were really too busy to use those services or believe it or not some of them said they didn't know they existed which we found that to be kind of interesting because we go to classes and present and we have all sorts of flyers that are distributed and the Faculty know. We also had student who has used the Transcender test prep software and they found that, that was a definite benefit for them because that helps them pass the certification test as well as the exams in their classes. And then those who took full advantage of the services were wildly supportive of what we had been doing and they were definitely saying that that was helping them along in staying from one semester to another and in fact on the, next slide in finishing their credentials.

### **NISGTC Sustainability**

Ann Beheler - We do know that in previous semester we have had a great increase in the number of credentials completed plus or minus forty percent increase due to we think career coach intervention, tutoring intervention we are still working on the data overall at this point we're expecting the completions for spring but it's our sense that it's going to be greatly increased and as I've said I've already told you that we've gone from requesting two career coaches to be funded on hard money to 3. We do not know in fact that is going to be funded at this point but it's looking very positive. Like I said earlier the curriculum is actually institutionalized because it is implemented into our program and that is the business we are in. We also spent a significant amount of money on virtual laboratory both the equipment and also on some small equipment in terms of computers in the classroom, also professionalized Cisco gear because we are in the networking space we did get support from IT originally

where they agreed to support the maintenance costs after the grant was over and in addition to the maintenance costs, there are actually personnel costs to support the virtual laboratory, we did create the software for some additional virtual labs for the virtual laboratory and there is some personnel support for that as well. We have been doing some of the required training and transition while we still have the DOL dollars to support that. So these are some of the things that we have been doing interesting enough in the forum that we have with students with respect to the virtual laboratory we found out that sometimes the students that were actually sitting in the classroom with the hardware there would do the labs on the virtual laboratory instead of actually getting up and going over and working with the hardware that was physically in the room, I don't quite understand that but that's ok I guess it was easier and of course the virtual laboratories are available 24/ 7 so they were able to go home and do the lab again. So these are some of the things that we've been able to sustain and we did start very very early in figuring out how to get the data to be able to support these sorts of things.

### **Poll #2: How Much Will You Sustain?**

Ann Beheler - So we're ready for our next poll, what did you think, how are you going to sustain? Are you thinking you're going to sustain everything, do you think you can sustain 75 percent, 25% or nothing at all or are you not sure? Let's give yourself a few minutes to pick your answer, and Mike if you're still on will you tell me the result because again I'm not seeing the results of the poll.

Michael Lesiecki - Yes and currently folks are responding to the poll it's just give them one more second.

Ann Beheler - Thank you.

Michael Lesiecki - Ok friends make your best guesses in the polls I'll give you a countdown 5, 4, 3, 2, 1 and I'm sharing the poll now and it says 10% think they need to sustain everything; 35 percent that's our biggest number they think they can sustain perhaps 75% that's pretty impressive; third choice is I probably won't sustain more than 25% and we had 19 percent of our audience choose that. But here's the interesting one only three percent said when the funding ends were done, so there's really an interest there are only three percent chose that. And then finally a fully a third of the audience 32% said that's why I'm here today trying to figure this out so it's an interesting spectrum of responses here for you.

Ann Beheler – Very, very interesting, thank you very much well hopefully you'll let us know how we can help you.

Michael Lesiecki – Ok your back live now, go ahead.

### **Tips to Consider in Planning to Sustain**

Ann Beheler - Okay thanks, so a few tips in summary to consider in planning for sustaining from the beginning figure out your best guess what parts of your work will likely have impact and could or should be sustained over time and why. Better to plan for collecting data on something that you think should be sustained and collect that data then to get to the end and not have the data you might need. Maybe you find something that you think it's going to be wonderful and then it doesn't turn out so yeah that's fine at least you would have the data if it did turn out to be very effective. And then are you going to sustain through institutionalization, funding through the college budget like our career coach request and that's a major request because we're asking to add personnel. Are you looking at in-kind support from partners or donations or combination of the above make sure you gather the data to support your potential request attention from the very beginning I guess that's kind of reiterating number one but

that's very important that you start from the beginning gathering data it's very hard to go back and get it after the fact. And talk frequently to all of your stakeholders and also talk to other grant leaders and director about sustainability how are they doing it? You don't have to reinvent the wheel, how are others getting their data to support their plans and I can't emphasize enough you really need data a feel-good feeling is not enough especially for trying to get hard money. And continually refine your plan, we started in our consortium putting our sustainability plan together in year one and we are still modifying them based on what's really real at this point in time.

### **Want More Sustainability Resources?**

Ann Beheler - More sustainability resources here we go again, again ATECentral.net if you look at the bottom /sustainability has a lot of them and again when you get the presentation these links will be hot and you'll be able to get to these resources.

### **Questions?**

Ann Beheler - Now questions if you have questions type them into the chat and I have one, one person said I think the National Science Foundation does not permit cost sharing and they don't, in kind in a grant proposal is sometimes considered cost sharing. If I have buy-in from my institution how do I show this so it does not look like cost sharing. How about I call on Elaine Craft to explain this.

Elaine Craft - Thanks Ann, the primary issue is that cost sharing is now prohibited by the NSF ATE program and so you have to be very careful in a proposal that nothing that you include in it can be picked up as you know as stating that you are doing cost sharing. What you can do it is, you can include letters of commitment in your appendices and as long as those letters of commitment are very specific about what these individuals will do and contribute to the project but not in monetary terms don't put dollars with anything but you can put that people are going to serve on advisory groups, you know go on weekly outreach trips, you know anything like that's fine as long as you don't put a dollar amount with it and you can describe this in your project description as well just make sure that you don't put anything in the budget and make sure that you don't associate a dollar amount with what somebody's gonna do to support you.

Ann Beheler - Thanks Elaine. And in terms of your own institution I think it is perfectly reasonable to talk about what the institution itself will do after the grant is over that's perfectly okay it's just a matter of not talking about what it's going to do during the grant for example I think it's ok to say for equipment purchases during the period of the grant the institution has agreed to maintain it after the grant so that's a little bit different. I don't see other questions I'm gonna move onto opportunities.

### **Join Us- All Webinars 3 pm Eastern**

Ann Beheler - All of our webinars are 3 p.m. Eastern and we have one coming up on the 18<sup>th</sup> we've already done some webinars on ensuring the best business engagement and we have yet again another approach on secrets for strong industry engagement more details about this one will be forthcoming soon.

### **Join us in Portland, OR!**

Ann Beheler - We also have a conference coming up July 27 through the 30th in Portland, Oregon and this is our HI-TEC Information Exchange Conference that is put on by the National Science Foundation.

### **Register for HI-TEC and TAACCCT Convening**

Ann Beheler - But this one is really, really special for the TAACCCT grantees as well there is a whole track during this conference that is TAACCCT specific there are results from round one and round two grants and some round three grants on specific topics and you can look at this particular website to register a above and also you can look at if you leave off the registration.php you can look above at the actual program and see what's there. Plus there is a free convening on Friday morning the 31st you're invited to come for that and you're also invited to talk about technical assistance needs that you might have we're going to have several people there who will be able to answer your questions, up to and including small consultation sessions that will be available for you on a variety of subjects.

### **Q&A and Contacts**

Ann Beheler - And so we are at the end, we will offer you one more chance for Q&A and here are the links to the people that have presented today or the email addresses at least we are willing to help you and we will be having more webinars. We're also going to be there for the HI-TEC conference and we're very hopeful that we can have a few in the way that you find appropriate so let us know how we can help. Anything else from the presenters today or any other questions that anyone might have, hearing that I would say that we are finished and thank you very much for joining us today.